MUNICIPAL CORPORATION OF GREATER MUMBAI

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE

MINUTES OF THE **FORTY EIGHTH** MEETING

Date: **Saturday, 22.01.2022.**

Time: 04.00 PM to 5:00 PM

The following members were present:

• Dr. Ramanath Jha	Chairman;
• Dr. Manjiri Kamat	Historian, Mumbai University.
• Dr. P.P. Bhave	Environmental Engineer, VJTI.
• Shri Chetan Raikar	Structural Engineer and Conservation Expert.
• Ar. Kirtida Unwalla	Conservation Architect.
• Dr. Kantikumar Pawar	Archaeologist / conservation expert

The following officers were in attendance:

• Smt Aparna Bhatte	Dy. Mun. Architect (D.P.)

Leave of absence was granted to Prof. A. A. Bage, Prof. Rajiv Mishra, Dr. Abhay Bambole, and Shri Sabyasachi Mukherjee, members of the Committee, who were unable to attend the meeting owing to preoccupations

1. Sr. No: 444 **Grade: - Precinct**

'Parsi Colony Precinct

Proposal: - Ongoing footpath improvement works around Five Gardens situated within Parsi Colony Heritage Precinct in F/N Ward, Mumbai.

Consultant: - M/s Pankaj Joshi Consultants – Conservation Architect.

Ref: - i) Representation received from Mr. Malcom Desai, resident of Parsi Colony;
ii) Site visit of MHCC dated 21.01.2022;
iii) MHCC remarks dated 21.01.2022;
iv) Meeting of the MHCC dated 22.01.2022.

This is with reference to the email received by the MHCC on 18.01.2022 in the subject matter (copy attached), expressing serious concern about damage to the trees and its roots due to the ongoing footpath improvement works around Five Gardens. The site u/r of Five Gardens is situated within the 'Parsi Colony Heritage Precinct' listed at Sr. No. 444 in the heritage list of F/N ward and it is one of the significant heritage precincts especially for its tree lined streets, public gardens and urban squares.

MUMBAI HERITAGE CONSERVATION COMMITTEE M.H.C.C.

Scanned with CamScanner

The said matter was discussed by the MHCC in its meeting held on 20.01.2022. As per direction of the Chairman MHCC, the site was inspected by Committee members on 21.01.2022 and it was recommended by MHCC vide its remarks dated 21.01.2022 that the ongoing works shall be stopped and the details of the work u/r along with the permissions shall be presented before the MHCC for consideration at the earliest.

Discussion of the MHCC in today's meeting: - The meeting was attended by the consultant Shri Pankaj Joshi and the matter was discussed. It was informed that the MCGM Roads Department has undertaken four demonstrative projects in the city, eastern and western suburbs to improve walkability and the pedestrian experience and out of the four streets, the stretch along Lady Jehangir Road, from Wadala Stataion to Ruia College in the F-North Ward, overlaps partially with the Parsi Colony Precinct at the Five Gardens area. It was mentioned that the scope of work is similar to that the work carried out in 'A' Ward as pilot project; however no specific clearance of the MHCC was obtained for the work u/r. It was further informed that due care was taken regarding the safety of trees during the work; however, unfortunately damage to the tree roots at some instances occurred due to negligence and technical incompetence of the contractor / labour. It was assured that following all observations on site and discussions, every precaution will be taken to ensure that tree surrounds are maximized in size to increase the soil area around the trees, any surface roots will be covered with soil and the basalt part is reinstated with a firm, levelled and a universally accessible surface.

The matter was deliberated at length and the Committee at the outset expressed its willingness to support infrastructure up gradation works that is in the larger interest of the public and the city, while preserving and protecting the natural heritage of the city. The Committee also expressed the faith in the expertise of the conservation architect and advised architect to take all necessary precautions and measures to safeguard the tree and its roots. Considering all the above, the MHCC decided to consent with the ongoing footpath improvement works around Five Gardens, subject to the following suggestions:

i) All work shall be carried out by labour with proficiency for such works and under expert supervision at multiple levels.
ii) Each tree being different in its structure, should be dealt subjectively and specific designs shall be made accordingly.
iii) A sub-committee of the MHCC comprising Dr. P.P. Bhave, Er. Chetan Raikar and Ar. Kirtida Unwalla, shall monitor the ongoing works and take part in the discussions with the community.

Chairman
Mumbai Heritage Conservation Committee

Scanned with CamScanner